COMPARATIVE STUDIES OF INNOVATION IN MODERN HIGHER EDUCATION SYSTEM OF INDONESIA AND PAKISTAN

Arsalan Ahmad[1*], Radyum Ikono[1], Harjito[1], dan Eri Sofiatry[2]

[1]Manajemen Inovasi, Sekolah Pascasarjana, Universitas Teknologi Sumbawa, Indonesia
[2]Ilmu Komunikasi, Fakultas Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik, Universitas Teknologi Sumbawa, Indonesia
Corresponding author: engr.arsalanahmad@outlook.com

ABSTRAK

Penelitian ini menggali lanskap pendidikan tinggi global yang terus berkembang, menyajikan studi kasus komparatif mengenai reformasi inovatif dalam sistem pendidikan tinggi di Indonesia dan Pakistan. Dengan menggunakan pendekatan kualitatif, penelitian ini melibatkan lima belas sarjana dari kedua negara yang belajar di Indonesia sebagai informan. Pengumpulan data melibatkan Google form, wawancara, dan dokumentasi, dengan analisis deskriptif kualitatif sebagai metode analisis utama. Hasilnya memberikan analisis komprehensif mengenai strategi inovatif dalam sistem pendidikan tinggi di kedua negara, dalam mengatasi tantangan yang ditimbulkan oleh pergeseran global. Indonesia menekankan internasionalisasi melalui program yang fleksibel, penjaminan mutu melalui LAA dan BANPT, rekrutmen dosen asing, dan publisitas media yang luas, seperti yang digambarkan oleh Universitas Gadjah Mada dan Universitas Indonesia. Sebaliknya, Pakistan, yang dipandu oleh Komisi Pendidikan Tinggi (HEC), menyelaraskan institusinya dengan standar internasional, terbukti dengan kehadiran mereka di QS World Ranking 2023 dari National University of Science and Technology (NUST) dan Quaid-e-Azam University (QAU). Studi ini menekankan perlunya modernisasi dan internasionalisasi di kedua negara, dan menganjurkan upaya kolaboratif antar lembaga, industri, dan pemerintah untuk mendorong kemajuan yang berkelanjutan. Penelitian ini diakhiri dengan seruan agar kebijakan-kebijakan inovatif disertai dengan sistem pemantauan, tindak lanjut, dan evaluasi yang kuat oleh badan-badan pemerintah seperti Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan dan HEC, sehingga dapat memberikan panduan penting bagi para pembuat kebijakan dan memberikan kontribusi yang berarti terhadap wacana akademis.
Kata Kunci: Sistem Pendidikan Modern; Pendidikan Tinggi; Inovasi; Indonesia; Pakistan.

ABSTRACT

This research delves into the evolving landscape of global higher education, presenting a comparative case study of innovative reforms in the higher education systems of Indonesia and Pakistan. Employing a qualitative approach, the study engages fifteen scholars from both countries studying in Indonesia as informants. Data collection involves Google forms, interviews, and documentation, with qualitative descriptive analysis as the primary analytical method. The results provide a comprehensive analysis of the innovative strategies within the higher education systems of both nations, addressing challenges posed by global shifts. Indonesia emphasizes internationalization through flexible programs, quality assurance via LAA and BANPT, foreign faculty recruitment, and extensive media publicity, illustrated by Gadjah Mada University and the University of Indonesia. In contrast, Pakistan, guided by the Higher Education Commission (HEC), aligns its institutions with international standards, as evidenced by their presence in the QS World Ranking 2023 of National University of Science and Technology (NUST) and Quaid-e-Azam University (QAU). The study emphasizes the necessity for modernization and internationalization in both countries, advocating for collaborative efforts among institutions, industry, and government to foster sustained progress. The research concludes with a call for innovative policies to be accompanied by robust monitoring,

follow-up, and evaluation systems by government bodies such as MOEC and HEC, providing crucial guidance to policymakers and contributing meaningfully to academic discourse.

Keywords: Modern Education Systems; Higher Education; Innovation; Indonesia; Pakistan.

1. INTRODUCTION

The two parameters of competition among universities in 21st century are modernization and globalization (Jamil et al., 2023). To be in the race of competition, higher education (HE) should build strong reputation and attract high calibre staff with best research and development (R&D) implementations (Warwick, 2014). This seems impossible to surpass best institutes without innovation and globalization in education (Khalid et al., 2017). Many developing countries including Indonesia and Pakistan are struggling to meet the modernization of HE standards (Zakaria et al., 2016). Therefore, current case would be hot topic and first ray of shine for the concern audience.

In Indonesian HE, the biggest agenda is internationalization. Therefore, many programs are launched by government of Indonesia for the participation of academic institutes. The basic concern is to introduce local culture with goal to improve international image and develop international cooperation that capture attention of foreign students and faculty in Indonesia (Tian, 2022). Sibawaihi & Fernandes studies the importance of internationalizations and multiculturalism the two parameters in agenda of HE of Indonesia (Sibawaihi & Fernandes, 2023). The flexibility of forming international programs, hiring foreign faculty as well budget is important in the application of globalization of HE Institutes (HEIs).

Indonesian HE put number of rules and practices to foster internationalization. Paying attention to publicity and uplifting international projects via multiple social media platforms. The promotion is not for economic means but also necessary for HEIs to receive outstanding accomplishments. Moreover, Indonesia also employs paper printing and oral publicity a perfect promotional system which enhanced international reputation (Knowles, 1977).

Higher education system (HES) of Indonesia signed number of memorandum of understanding (MOU) with countries such as Jinan University and Guangzhou University of Traditional Chinese Medicine. Furthermore, HE of Indonesia introduces student mobility programs to raise standard and provide international exposure to national students in proving global perspective (Tian, 2022). In 2015, the government introduced English as language of instruction in bilingual HE programs and curriculums in institutes for effective international exchange (Dewi, 2017).

Last but not least three Indonesian Universities are in Quacquarelli Symonds (QS) World ranking 2023. These includes Gadjah Mada University (UGM) ranked 254 with 2 to 39 international student & faculty ratio, University of Indonesia (UI) ranked 290 with 5 to 73 international student & faculty ratio, and Institute of Technology Bandung (ITB) ranked 303 with 3 to 67 international student & faculty ratio. The vision and goals of top HEI of Indonesia includes service of humanity with basic moral values for the service of the world & Indonesia. Innovation, excellence and independent academia are the core values.

Many Pakistani universities are adopting international standards of education. The Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan started implemented micro and macro level plans for improvement and internationalization of HEIs. Moreover, HEC is responsible body for HEIs to liaison with international organizations for educational diplomacy and attraction of international students. Along with international grants HEC Pakistan, offer multiple programs such as Faculty development programs (Foreign and indigenous), International conferences, and workshop funds, scholarships for International students such as from Organization of Islamic Cooperation (OIC) and Commonwealth, to study in top Pakistani universities.

In addition, HEC provides financial assistance and foreign scholarships to faculty members of HEIs and prospective students for less developed areas to ensure the opportunities. Student mobility programs are enhanced on fast pass as a results of HEC. As per Pakistan country guide, more than 60,000 students are studying in United Kingdom, United States, Australia, Germany, Malaysia, Indonesia and many other countries.

Many international universities have started operations in Pakistan such as Pak Austria Fachhochschule Institute of Applied Sciences and Technology (PAF-IAST) in Haripur and University of Bolton (UOBI) in

Islamabad. The HEC of Pakistan introduced the policy 2022 to developed schools with international campuses. This basically enhance HEIs to offer reputed programs for an international market.

In Quacquarelli Symonds world ranking 2023, 11 Pakistani universities were among top 1000 and three universities were among top 500. These includes National University of Science and Technology (NUST) ranked 358 with 6 to 3 international student faculty ratio, Quaid-i-Azam University (QAU) ranked 370 with 3 to 4 international student faculty ratio and Pakistan Institute of Engineering and Applied Sciences (PIEAS) ranked 398. The goals of Pakistani universities aim on basic good level education, business innovations, moral ethics and cultural diversity. The NUST has taken number of initiatives to improve its reputation for internationalization.

The research problem for study is that the HEIs are to modernize and internationalize (Shaturaev, 2021). In both countries none have study the upskilling of HEIs and issues. This would be the first study in comparison of strategy, policies and innovation in HES of both countries. The research questions that arise from the problems are: What are the issues and problems faced by HEIs in Indonesia and Pakistan? And How Indonesia and Pakistan can improve HEIs in comparison to other Asian countries?

2. METHODOLOGY

This research uses the qualitative method, where the aim is to describe the research method undertaken to accomplish the research objectives, this is followed by discussing the research strategy used in this study. The key informant's selection and the data collection method are also clarified. Finally, the data analysis the method and data presentation plan for this case study will be outlined followed by a summarization mentioning the limitations that occurred during the research.

The current case is qualitative approach and is descriptive and exploratory in nature for data collection (Morse, 1991). The primary data is collected through questionnaires via online interviews. The respondents are divided into three main categories social sciences, managerial sciences and natural sciences scholars (Prita Prabawangi et al., 2021). This helps to understand enrolment percentage of Pakistani scholars in each category. Further, the three categories would be further divided in to three interviewees who are Pakistani and Indonesian scholars (Undergraduates, Master and Ph.D.). Hence, the main criteria for survey would aim at Pakistani and Undergraduate Indonesian scholars. The focus would be to achieve research objectives through series of open ended questions (Geer, 1988).

Research design can be defined as the researcher's robust plan for getting data that will employed to solve the research issues, in this case the innovation in Pakistani and Indonesian Universities, the research and scholarship programs, impact of COVID pandemic reforms and comparative management policies of both government bodies. Case studies are basically design of inquiry found in many fields in which the researcher develops an in-depth analysis of a case, that is bounded by time and activity where researchers collect detailed information using various data collection procedures (Creswell, 1998; Creswell & Creswell, 2017). The research is based on an inductive approach as the main agenda is to explore the general image to define clear comparison between HEIs of Indonesia and Pakistan. To develop in-depth understanding of MESs of both countries out of the gathered primary and secondary data, explained below.

2.1. Place and Time of Research

This research is focused on current Pakistani and Indonesian educational systems, their novel approaches and comparative analysis. The focus will be on Pakistani and undergraduate Indonesian scholars who experienced diversity, culture difference, research and technological integration. The time span of this case study is from 15 August 2023 until 25 December 2023, where the primary and secondary data were collected during this period. Meanwhile, this research will cover how Indonesia and Pakistan can improve HEIs in comparison to other Asian countries in order to get a clear image of the current situation of the HESs and possibility of improvements.

2.2. Data and Data Collection

The data in this research incorporate primary and secondary data. The primary data includes in-depth information from stakeholders about the educational systems of both countries and comparison. The secondary data includes the literature reviews and explorations. Information from journal articles, are collected from respective universities of informants, Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) for Indonesia and HEC for Pakistan websites (Warwick, 2014).

The main concern that this research addresses is the MES of Indonesia and Pakistan. The population of this study consist as all Pakistani and Indonesian Scholars in Indonesia. To gather data for analysis, semi-structured interviews were conducted with the key respondents who are involved in the HE sector. Those who have in-depth knowledge about the education in Pakistan and Indonesia. The problems with the vision on the future plans for the modern educational sector in the Indonesia and Pakistan. These semi-structured interviews are not designed to generate representative units in a statistical sense, rather it is to improve the understanding and to represent the clear image of the modern academic techniques in Indonesia and Pakistan. The researcher hopes through these interviews to be able to portray the situation of the innovation in educational management strategies as discussed in the objectives of study.

The questionnaires prompt for in-depth discussion is prepared. A form of pre structured interview questions serve as a guideline for the interviewer to get in-depth understanding and the recorded information for further analysis. The interview would of three parts: the first part is a brief introduction of the research study followed by a broad open questions in order to get general and demographic information, the second main-part is a set of in-depth and detailed questions, and the third part is the conclusion, & inquiry related to country of origin and clarification questions when needed.

First a google-form (G-form) was prepared to receive a pre-information from interviewees. The total 21 responses were received. Out of theses the 15 were interviewed and other were either not interested or irrelevant. Further, the researchers set a criterion for selecting the key respondents for the pre-schedule interviews:

1) Current Undergraduate, and Graduate Indonesian students.
2) Current Undergraduate, and Graduate Pakistani students.
3) Pakistani Alumni of Indonesian Universities.

To ensure the confidentiality of respondents in the research, the information of the interviewees was decoded.

Regarding the documents used for this case study, the researchers carried an analysis of the educational frameworks and the national research and curriculums. In order to determine if the polices and implications are carried out by the Pakistani and Indonesian HEIs in collaboration with international institutions are in accordance with the educational strategies. This pervious data is explained by themes to obtain a uniform result that allows the subsequent triangulation and corresponding analysis that answers the questions of the present investigation.

2.3. Data Analysis

The interview transcripts are divided into segments, and collapsed into categories based on the themes. These themes that are implemented to help the analysis identify and interpret recurrent and emergent themes, which will be later synthesized to organize the analysed data. To ensure the qualitative validity and to strengthen the validity in this research, the triangulation method of the data that were collected from multiple resources is implemented (Merriam, 1988).

3. RESULTS AND DICUSSION

The researchers are presenting the data collected and reveal the findings and themes from the interviews, document analysis, and other secondary data. In addition, the findings are analyzed to answer

the questions of this research. After presenting the results of each method used for collecting data, it is discussed, and the combined results are interpreted in this chapter. Furthermore, one can examine various aspects of these MESs and discuss their similarities, differences, and implications.

3.1. Modern Higher Education of Indonesia

HE in Indonesia has undergone significant transformations in recent decades, evolving into a dynamic and diverse landscape that reflects the country's aspirations for economic growth, social development, and global competitiveness.

Modern HE in Indonesia encompasses an assessment of the country's educational system, its achievements, challenges, and ongoing reforms. These interviewees provided insights into the Indonesian education system, emphasizing the importance of practical and skill-based learning.

3.1.1. Quality Assurance

Quality assurance in modern HE in Indonesia has become increasingly important as the nation seeks to improve the overall quality and competitiveness of its universities (Teixeira & Shin, 2020). But as per Interviewee XV said, ''the main challenges are education quality and infrastructures''. Along with the recent study by (M. Pradana et al., 2023) sheds light on the challenges and strategies related to quality assurance in Indonesian HE. This article discusses the significance of quality assurance mechanisms using modern educational tools such as Chatgpt and their role in ensuring that HEIs meet international standards of excellence (Leal Filho et al., 2020). The Indonesian government, through the National Accreditation Agency for Higher Education (BAN-PT), has implemented various quality assurance mechanisms (Marginson & Sawir, 2011; Sudianto & Simon, 2021). Research by (Indarta et al., 2022) highlights the role of BAN-PT in evaluating and accrediting HEIs and programs.

Referring to the respective laws and regulations, Accreditation Council for Education (ACE) or Lembaga Akreditasi Mandiri Kependidikan (LAMDIK) (*LAMDIK/ACE Resmi Sebagai Full Member INQAAHE (International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education) – LAM Kependidikan*, 2023) has committed to fulfil every customer's/ stakeholder's need by implementing continuous improvement of Quality Management System ISO 9001:2015.ACE is an independent accrediting agency that provides accreditation services to educational study programs in Indonesia. LAMDIK has shown itself to be an excellent quality assurance institution in the field of education because in a short time it has gained the trust to become a full member of one of the most prominent international educational accreditation institutions.

However, challenges persist in maintaining consistent quality across institutions and programs as discussed by (Pradhan et al., 2014; Suryadarma, 2009; Suryadarma & Suryahadi, 2010).While there have been notable efforts to enhance quality assurance, challenges persist. A recent article by (Yudono et al., 2022) identifies issues such as the need for greater transparency in accreditation processes and the importance of addressing regional disparities in quality. The study discusses potential improvements in quality assurance practices during admission process to ensure more equitable access to quality HE. Quality assurance in modern HE in Indonesia is a dynamic field with ongoing developments and challenges. Research and policy efforts continue to shape the landscape of quality assurance mechanisms. Future research may focus on the effectiveness of these mechanisms in improving educational outcomes, as well as exploring innovative approaches to maintain and enhance the quality of HE in Indonesia.

3.1.2. Internationalization

Internationalization is another key aspect of quality assurance in Indonesian HE. International partnerships and collaborations can contribute to quality improvement shown by transcriptions of many scholars. The other interviews emphasize the role of global perspectives and international benchmarking in enhancing the quality of education offered by Indonesian universities.

Internationalization is a prominent feature of modern HE in Indonesia, as reflected in recent research and development efforts. A study by (Pratiwi & Waluyo, 2023) emphasizes that Indonesian universities are increasingly engaging in international partnerships, student and faculty exchange programs, and online digital global research collaborations. Indonesian universities are actively internationalizing, attracting international students and fostering global collaborations.

Internationalization efforts contribute to the quality of education and research (Marginson, 2016). These initiatives are crucial for enhancing the global competitiveness of Indonesian HEIs. One notable aspect of internationalization is the influx of international students and faculty into Indonesian universities especially foreign. The research conducted by current researcher and (Akbar & Hidayat, 2022) underscores how the presence of international students work towards cultural diversity and improved the academic environment through community services.

The international faculty members bring diverse perspectives and expertise, elevating the quality of education and research in Indonesia. Additionally, the internationalization of HE in Indonesia has led to the globalization of curriculum content. In short, this showed Indonesian universities are revising their curricula to incorporate global perspectives and offer courses on international issues. This not only prepares Indonesian students to engage with a globalized world but also attracts international students seeking a well-rounded education. Furthermore, the internationalization of research and publications is gaining momentum in Indonesian academia. Research highlights that Indonesian scholars are increasingly collaborating with international counterparts and publishing in international journals. This trend contributes to the dissemination of Indonesian research on the global stage and enhances the country's reputation in various fields. Internationalization is a pivotal dimension of modern HE in Indonesia. It facilitates global collaborations, enriches the academic environment, and enhances the nation's position in the global knowledge economy. Continued research in this area will shed light on the evolving landscape of internationalization and its impacts on Indonesian HE.

3.1.3. Community Development and Services

Indonesia's HES significantly contributes to the development of its communities, exerting influence across various dimensions. A study by (Nurvita et al., 2022) highlights the role of HE in fostering economic development, emphasizing how the acquisition of advanced skills and knowledge by graduates positively correlates with increased productivity and income levels within communities. This economic empowerment, in turn, has a cascading effect on poverty alleviation and overall community well-being.

Moreover, HEIs in Indonesia play a crucial role in cultural preservation and enhancement, as discussed by (Hidayati et al., 2020; Wang, 2019). The study underscores the importance of universities as centers for cultural exchange, research, and the promotion of indigenous knowledge. By engaging with local communities, HEIs contribute to the preservation of Indonesia's rich cultural heritage while simultaneously facilitating its adaptation to contemporary challenges.

The impact of HE on community health is a subject explored by (Anwar & Pujiyanto, 2022; RAHMAN et al., 2021), who demonstrate the positive correlation between the presence of healthcare professionals educated in HEIs and improved health outcomes in communities. Their research underscores the pivotal role played by universities in producing skilled healthcare professionals who address the diverse health challenges faced by Indonesian communities. The interviewee II and XV have background from health sciences demonstrated this aspect very well.

In the realm of environmental sustainability, the study conducted by (I. P. Y. B. Pradana et al., 2022) emphasizes the pivotal role of HE in promoting sustainable development practices. The researchers argue that programs in environmental science and engineering empower graduates to address environmental issues such as deforestation and climate change. Through community engagement initiatives, HE institutions contribute to the implementation of sustainable practices that benefit both the environment and local communities.

These academic insights collectively underscore the intricate ways in which HE positively influences the development of communities in Indonesia (Eprilianto et al., 2022). By addressing economic disparities, preserving cultural heritage, enhancing community health, and promoting environmental sustainability, HE emerges as a cornerstone for holistic and sustainable development within the Indonesian context.

3.2. Modern Higher Education of Pakistan

In the rapidly evolving landscape of modern HE in Pakistan, an article by (Bukhsh et al., 2022) sheds light on the importance of aligning curricula with industry demands especially in pharmacology. The study underscores the need for universities to foster practical skills and knowledge, equipping graduates with the competencies needed to succeed in a dynamic job market. Expanding on this theme, (Munawar et al., 2023) and (S. Ahmad & Ahmed, 2023) emphasize the role of quality assurance, entrepreneurship and technology in HE. They argue that the integration of digital tools and online learning platforms can enhance accessibility and the quality of education, bridging the gap between urban and rural areas.

One crucial aspect of modern HE in Pakistan explored by (Qureshi & Kalsoom, 2022) is the issue of governance in professional programmes. Their research highlights the necessity of transparent and accountable governance structures to ensure equitable access to professional education resources and promote academic excellence. The quality of research output in Pakistani universities has been a subject of debate as shown by many Pakistani scholars in Indonesia. A recent article by (W. A. Khan et al., 2023) addresses this concern, suggesting that universities should incentivize research through funding opportunities and collaboration with international institutions as by Japanese Universities.

Gender equity remains a challenge in HE, as discussed by (Malik et al., 2023). Their study calls for policies that promote female enrollment and retention in Science Technology Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) fields, recognizing the importance of diversity in academia as well maternal health. In a critical analysis of faculty development, (W. A. Khan et al., 2023) argue that investing in faculty training and support is essential for improving the overall quality of HE. They propose a mentorship program to enhance pedagogical skills and research productivity. Pakistan's HE sector is also grappling with issues of financing and affordability. (Mangi et al., 2021) explore innovative financing models and regionalism, suggesting public-private partnerships as a means to increase access while maintaining educational standards. The role of international collaborations in modern HE is addressed by Pakistani scholars.

Lastly, (Raza et al., 2023) highlight the importance of student centred learning in modern HE in comparison to China. Their research underscores the significance of active learning methods, personalized feedback, and inclusive teaching practices to enhance the overall educational experience.

Modern HE in Pakistan is a multifaceted and evolving field, as evidenced by the diverse range of research topics covered in recent journal articles. While challenges persist, such as governance and gender equity, innovative approaches, and international collaborations offer promising avenues for improvement. The integration of technology and the lessons learned from the pandemic further underscore the need for adaptability and a student-centric focus in shaping the future of HE in Pakistan. Modern HE in Pakistan involves an assessment of the country's education system, its achievements, challenges, and ongoing reforms. Below is a data review of modern HE in Pakistan:

3.2.1. Quality Assurance

Quality assurance in education is a crucial aspect of Pakistan's HE landscape, as evident in recent interviews. These studies highlight the significance of accreditation systems, faculty development, external assessments, and policy frameworks in ensuring and enhancing the educational quality across the country. Quality assurance mechanisms in Pakistani HE have been

evolving, with the establishment of the HEC to monitor and maintain academic standards (Adeel et al., 2023). Many Pakistani Scholars from remote areas delve into the challenges and opportunities of quality assurance in Pakistani HE.

Addressing the role of faculty development in quality assurance, Further, they underscore the significance of continuous professional development for educators. The interviews suggest that investing in faculty training and support programs can significantly improve teaching quality and research output in Pakistan's HEIs. External quality assessment mechanisms and their effectiveness are discussed in an article by (Ali et al., 2021).The study evaluates the impact of external accreditation bodies on enhancing the quality of education involving future research opportunities. It emphasizes the need for clear evaluation criteria and transparent assessment processes to maintain accountability and drive continuous improvement.

Quality assurance in distance education is a pertinent topic, especially in the context of recent global events. Research by (Iqbal et al., 2022) focuses on the challenges and strategies for ensuring quality in online and blended learning environments in Pakistani HEIs. The study highlights the importance of course design, learner support, and assessment methods in maintaining educational standards. In a broader context, the article by (Asrar-ul-Haq et al., 2023) critically examines the role of government policies in quality assurance in Pakistani education and role of universities in social responsibility. It evaluates the impact of policy decisions on the educational quality at all levels and suggests recommendations for a more effective regulatory framework.

3.2.2. Internationalization

Pakistan is making efforts to internationalize its HES, with initiatives to attract foreign students and faculty (I. Ahmad et al., 2019). Collaboration with ''international institutions and partnerships are growing, contributing to the internationalization process'' revealed by scholars particularly from Lahore and Karachi.

Internationalization in education is a vital aspect of Pakistan's HE landscape, as demonstrated in current research. The studies underscore the significance of international collaborations, quality assurance, research and innovation, policy evaluation, and student mobility in the context of educational internationalization. As Pakistan continues to foster global engagement in its education sector, these research findings offer valuable insights and recommendations for policymakers, educators, and institutions seeking to enhance internationalization efforts. In a recent article by (Zahid & Neary, 2023), the authors examine the significance of internationalization in Pakistan's HE sector. The research emphasizes the role of international collaborations, faculty and student exchange programs, and the recruitment of foreign faculty in enhancing the global perspective of Pakistani universities.

Addressing the challenges and opportunities of internationalization, (Alam et al., n.d.) conducted research on the impact of global partnerships on academic quality. Their study discusses the importance of maintaining academic standards while engaging in international collaborations, emphasizing the need for effective quality assurance mechanisms.

The article by (Reza et al., 2021) explores the role of internationalization in research and innovation in Pakistani universities and medium enterprises. It discusses how collaboration with foreign institutions can boost research output, facilitate knowledge transfer, and enhance the research ecosystem in the country. In a critical analysis of government policies, Pakistani postgraduates observe the role of policy frameworks in promoting internationalization in Pakistani education.

3.2.3. Community Development and Services

HE in Pakistan plays a pivotal role in shaping the development trajectory of its communities, influencing economic, social, and cultural dimensions. Research conducted by (Mastoi et al., 2019) underscores the significance of HE in fostering economic development. The study highlights how universities serve as hubs for skill development and knowledge acquisition, producing graduates

equipped to contribute to various sectors of the economy. The resultant increase in human capital, productivity, and entrepreneurship positively impacts community development, leading to enhanced livelihoods and economic well-being.

Additionally, HEIs in Pakistan contribute significantly to social development and cultural preservation. As explored by (S. R. Khan, 2022), universities play a central role in promoting cultural awareness, diversity, and social cohesion. The study emphasizes the role of HE in producing graduates who are not only academically proficient but also culturally competent, fostering a sense of community identity and unity.

Furthermore, the impact of HE on community health is a crucial facet discussed in the work of (Safdar & Khan, 2020). Their research delves into the role of universities in producing healthcare professionals and conducting research that addresses public health challenges. HEIs contribute to the development of healthcare infrastructure and the dissemination of health-related knowledge, ultimately improving the overall well-being of communities. This similarly revealed by interviewee XV.

In the context of environmental sustainability, recent studies by (Akhtar et al., 2022; Habib et al., 2021; Xie et al., 2023) emphasize the role of HE in fostering environmentally conscious practices. Universities, through academic programs and research initiatives, contribute to awareness and solutions related to environmental issues. This engagement ensures that communities are equipped with the knowledge and skills necessary for sustainable living and resource management.

In conclusion, the impact of HE on community development in Pakistan is comprehensive and multidimensional. From economic empowerment and cultural preservation to community health and environmental sustainability, HEIs serve as catalysts for positive change. These academic insights underscore the integral role of HE in shaping the trajectory of development in Pakistani communities.

3.3. Comparative Analysis of Educational Systems of both countries
3.3.1. Quality Assurance
i. Indonesia

Indonesia has made strides in quality assurance with the establishment of the BAN-PT revealed by interviewee I, and as discussed in "Quality Assurance in Indonesian Higher Education" (Tadjudin, 2009). Challenges include maintaining consistent quality across institutions especially digitalization (Hafifah & Sulistyo, 2020). LAMDIK has shown itself to be an excellent new quality assurance institution in the field of education because in a short time it has gained the trust to become a full member of one of the most prominent international educational accreditation institutions (*LAMDIK/ACE Resmi Sebagai Full Member INQAAHE (International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education) – LAM Kependidikan*, 2023).

ii. Pakistan

Pakistan's quality assurance mechanisms have been evolving, with the HEC playing a central role (Saqib et al., 2020). However, there are ongoing challenges in ensuring uniform quality (Aslam et al., 2021) and shared by Pakistani scholars in Indonesia.

Discussion:

Both countries face challenges in maintaining quality, but Indonesia's BAN-PT and latest LAM/LAMDIK quality assurance institutes in 2023 (*LAMDIK/ACE Resmi Sebagai Full Member INQAAHE (International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education) – LAM Kependidikan*, 2023) has made significant strides in this regard (Sudianto & Simon, 2021). Indonesia has a more developed quality assurance system in place by HEC, while Pakistan needs to enhance its mechanisms to ensure consistent quality.

3.3.2. Internationalization
i. Indonesia

Indonesian universities are actively internationalizing, attracting international students and fostering global collaborations (Abduh et al., 2018; Heriansyah, 2014; Tian, 2022).

ii. Pakistan

Pakistan is making efforts in internationalization, with initiatives to attract foreign students and faculty (Baloch et al., 2021; MUGHUL, 2008; Mughul, 2009).

Discussion:

Both countries are moving towards internationalization, which can enhance the educational quality and research (Leal Filho et al., 2020). However, Indonesia is more supporting for international students.

3.3.3. Community Development and Services
i. Indonesia

HE in Indonesia plays a crucial role in fostering community development. Research by (Nurvita et al., 2022) highlights the positive correlation between HE and economic development. Graduates, armed with advanced skills, contribute to local industries, thereby enhancing economic productivity. Additionally, HEIs serve as cultural hubs, preserving and promoting Indonesia's diverse heritage (Anwar & Pujiyanto, 2022; Hidayati et al., 2020). This multifaceted impact extends to community health, where HE produces healthcare professionals and contributes to improved health outcomes(I. P. Y. B. Pradana et al., 2022).

ii. Pakistan

In Pakistan, HE significantly contributes to community development. Studies by (Mastoi et al., 2019) emphasize its role in economic growth by producing skilled graduates and fostering entrepreneurship. HEIs in Pakistan also play a vital role in cultural preservation and social cohesion (S. R. Khan, 2022; Safdar & Khan, 2020). Furthermore, they contribute to community health through the production of healthcare professionals and research addressing public health challenges (Akhtar et al., 2022; Xie et al., 2023).

Discussion:

The transformative impact of HE on community development in both Indonesia and Pakistan can be easily seen. Economic empowerment, cultural preservation, community health, and social cohesion emerge as common themes. The multifaceted contributions of HE underscore its pivotal role in shaping the socio-economic and cultural landscapes of these nations. Policymakers and educators are continually prioritizing HE in Indonesia as a key driver for sustainable community development in these diverse contexts.

4. CONCLUSION

The results were presented, interpreted, and analyzed. This work is providing an overview of the research, highlighting key findings, conclusions, and recommendations for future researchers, as well as a number of implications. In short, the qualitative analysis of the interviews provides valuable insights into the experiences of Indonesian and Pakistani scholars in Indonesia's HES. The findings suggest that scholarship programs, research collaborations, and cultural exchange opportunities are key drivers of educational innovation and internationalization in both countries. Additionally, challenges related to language and adaptation were noted, highlighting areas where further support and improvement may be needed. HEIs in both countries has witnessed significant advancements in access, quality assurance, curriculum innovation, research, internationalization, and technology integration.

However, challenges such as access disparities, quality assurance, and research funding persist. Ongoing reforms and scholarship programs play a crucial role in addressing these challenges and promoting the internationalization of HE in Indonesia and Pakistan.

In summary, both Indonesia and Pakistan are working to modernize their educational systems and fostering innovation, but Indonesia has made more significant progress in certain areas like access, quality assurance, and research. Pakistan faces challenges related to resource allocation and infrastructure, highlighting areas for improvement that need to be addressed to keep pace with global trends in HE. Collaboration between institutions, industry, and government is crucial for the continued advancement of HE in both countries. In a nutshell a good words by Interviewee XV gave conclusive remarks;

''The Indonesian educational system emphasizes multiculturalism and Bahasa Indonesia, while Pakistan's system includes English instruction and a strong focus on religious education. Both face quality and access challenges''.

Despite the rich insights provided by the literature and findings, certain research gaps remain. Future research should delve deeper into the specific dynamics of innovation HE in both countries. Exploring the impact of cultural and socio-economic factors, the role of leadership in fostering innovation, and the long-term effects of policy interventions are areas that warrant further investigation. This research can contribute to a more nuanced understanding of the challenges and opportunities unique to each context. Furthermore, these policies should be followed by solid monitoring, follow-up, and evaluation systems by the government bodies MOEC and HEC to support their aim.

5. BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abduh, A., Rosmaladewi, R., & Basri, M. (2018). Internationalization awareness and commitment of Indonesian higher education. *The New Educational Review*, *51*(1), 162–172.

Adeel, S., Daniel, A. D., & Botelho, A. (2023). The effect of entrepreneurship education on the determinants of entrepreneurial behaviour among higher education students: A multi-group analysis. *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, *8*(1), 100324.

Ahmad, I., Ali, A., Gul, P., & Ali, B. (2019). Exploring Challenges to Sustainable Legal Development and Role of Higher Education in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, *6*(5), 25–32.

Ahmad, S., & Ahmed, A. (2023). The role of leadership in effective implementation of quality assurance mechanisms in higher education: An exploratory case study from Pakistan. *Quality Assurance in Education*, *31*(2), 230–246.

Akbar, I. R., & Hidayat, A. (2022). Penyuluhan Kemampuan Berwirausaha Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Sdm Anggota Majelis Ta'lim An-Nisaa Kecamatan Kemang. *Abdi Jurnal Publikasi*, *1*(1), 18–23.

Akhtar, S., Khan, K. U., Atlas, F., & Irfan, M. (2022). Stimulating student's pro-environmental behavior in higher education institutions: An ability–motivation–opportunity perspective. *Environment, Development and Sustainability*, *24*(3), 4128–4149. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10668-021-01609-4

Alam, J., Karim, T., & Khan, J. (n.d.). *Internationalization of Higher Education and Its Influence on the Educational Development in Pakistan*. Retrieved 28 October 2023, from https://www.qlantic.com/qjss/papers/h0OYpkqxOQ.pdf

Ali, I., Sultan, P., & Aboelmaged, M. (2021). A bibliometric analysis of academic misconduct research in higher education: Current status and future research opportunities. *Accountability in Research*, *28*(6), 372–393. https://doi.org/10.1080/08989621.2020.1836620

Anwar, M. N., & Pujiyanto, P. (2022). Analysis Of Socioeconomic Factors On Healthcare Facilities Utilization For Inpatient Care In Indonesia. *Prepotif: Jurnal Kesehatan Masyarakat*, *6*(1), 696–709.

Aslam, R., Khan, N., Asad, M. M., & Ahmed, U. (2021). Impact of technological pedagogical content knowledge on teachers' digital proficiency at classroom in higher education institution of Pakistan. *Interactive Technology and Smart Education*, *18*(1), 119–130.

Asrar-ul-Haq, M., Raza, Z., & Akhtar, M. W. (2023). Community development through university social responsibility: Precursors and outcomes. *Asia Pacific Education Review*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-023-09850-4

Baloch, N., Siming, L., Abraha, A., & Hong, S. (2021). Faculty research productivity: Differences between foreign and local doctoral degree holders in Pakistan. *Higher Education*, *82*(1), 203–225. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-020-00630-2

Bukhsh, A., Khan, T. M., Phisalprapa, P., Duangjai, A., Saokaew, S., Nawaz, M. S., Ahmed, H. S., & Goh, B.-H. (2022). Impact of pharmacist-led diabetes self-care education on patients with type 2 diabetes in Pakistan: A randomized controlled trial. *Frontiers in Pharmacology*, *13*, 754999.

Creswell, J. W. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions*. SAGE Publications, Incorporated.

Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2017). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage publications.

Dewi, A. (2017). English as a medium of instruction in Indonesian higher education: A study of lecturers' perceptions. *English Medium Instruction in Higher Education in Asia-Pacific: From Policy to Pedagogy*, 241–258.

Eprilianto, D. E., Ma'ruf, M. F., Pradana, G. W., Hilmi, A. N., & Habibah, U. N. (2022). Analysis of Students' Participation in Practicing the Concept of Green Campus. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, *1111*(1), 012072. https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1755-1315/1111/1/012072/meta

Geer, J. G. (1988). What do open-ended questions measure? *Public Opinion Quarterly*, *52*(3), 365–367.

Habib, M. N., Khalil, U., Khan, Z., & Zahid, M. (2021). Sustainability in higher education: What is happening in Pakistan? *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, *22*(3), 681–706.

Hafifah, G. N., & Sulistyo, G. H. (2020). Teachers'ict Literacy And Ict Integration In Elt In The Indonesian Higher Education Setting. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, *21*(3), 186–198.

Heriansyah, H. (2014). The impacts of internationalization and globalization on educational context. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, *8*(2), 164–170.

Hidayati, N. A., Waluyo, H. J., & Winarni, R. (2020). Exploring the Implementation of Local Wisdom-Based Character Education among Indonesian Higher Education Students. *International Journal of Instruction*, *13*(2), 179–198.

Indarta, Y., Jalinus, N., Waskito, W., Samala, A. D., Riyanda, A. R., & Adi, N. H. (2022). Relevansi kurikulum merdeka belajar dengan model pembelajaran abad 21 dalam perkembangan era society 5.0. *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, *4*(2), 3011–3024.

Iqbal, S. A., Ashiq, M., Rehman, S. U., Rashid, S., & Tayyab, N. (2022). Students' perceptions and experiences of online education in Pakistani Universities and Higher Education Institutes during COVID-19. *Education Sciences*, *12*(3), 166.

Jamil, H., Jaffar, K., Jamil, H., & Jaffar, K. (2023). *Institutional Policies and Initiatives for the Internationalization of HE: A Case of Southeast Asia and Pakistan*. IntechOpen. https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.109659

Khalid, J., Ali, A. J., Khaleel, M., & Islam, M. S. (2017). Towards global knowledge society; A SWOT analysis of higher education of Pakistan in context of internationalization. *Journal of Business*, *2*(2), 08–15.

Khan, S. R. (2022). *The cultural politics of curriculum in Pakistan: The challenges for pluralism, inclusion and the UN SDGs in a post-colonial context* [PhD Thesis, RMIT University]. https://researchrepository.rmit.edu.au/view/pdfCoverPage?instCode=61RMIT_INST&filePid=13301650630001341&download=true

Khan, W. A., Malik, M., & Fatima, G. (2023). Comparing Education Reforms Efforts in Japan and Pakistan: Implications for the Future of Teaching. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, *7*(3), 692–701.

Knowles, A. S. (1977). *The international encyclopedia of higher education.* https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED148207

LAMDIK/ACE Resmi sebagai Full Member INQAAHE (International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education) – LAM Kependidikan. (2023, December 16). https://lamdik.or.id/en/lamdik-ace-resmi-sebagai-full-member-inqaahe-international-network-for-quality-assurance-agencies-in-higher-education/

Leal Filho, W., Azul, A. M., Brandli, L., Özuyar, P. G., & Wall, T. (Eds.). (2020). Sustainable Development. In *Quality Education* (pp. 829–829). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95870-5_300249

Malik, F. R., Khan, A., Shahid, R., Khan, S. A., Khattak, U. G., & Khan, M. (2023). A Comparative descriptive study of impact of women education on the utilization of maternal health services in tertiary care hospitals of Peshawar. KPK, Pakistan. *Rawal Medical Journal*, *48*(3), 761–761.

Mangi, S. N., Shah, A. M., & Malik, A. (2021). Educational Stratification and nation building process in Pakistan. *Pakistan Perspectives*, *26*(1), 5.

Marginson, S. (2016). The worldwide trend to high participation higher education: Dynamics of social stratification in inclusive systems. *Higher Education*, *72*(4), 413–434. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-016-0016-x

Marginson, S., & Sawir, E. (2011). *Ideas for intercultural education*. https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=Ec-mKztNTlsC&oi=fnd&pg=PR13&dq=(Marginson+%26+Sawir,+2011)&ots=c4ukMp6ofj&sig=FQ933o2tgtgH8Xwc4tycvN5gbHE

Mastoi, A. G., Hai, L. X., & Saengkrod, W. (2019). Higher education service quality based on students' satisfaction in Pakistan. *European Scientific Journal ESJ*, *15*(11), 32–62.

Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach.* Jossey-Bass. https://psycnet.apa.org/record/1989-97006-000

Morse, J. M. (1991). Evaluating qualitative research. In *Qualitative Health Research* (Vol. 1, Issue 3, pp. 283–286). Sage Publications Sage CA: Thousand Oaks, CA.

Mughul, A. (2008). *Foreign Faculty Hiring Program-FFHP: The Brain-Gain Drive of the Higher Education Commission in Pakistan* [Master's Thesis]. https://trepo.tuni.fi/handle/10024/80400

Mughul, A. (2009). Foreign Faculty Hiring Program In Pakistan: Problems & Prospects. *ICERI2009 Proceedings*, 2550–2563. https://library.iated.org/view/MUGHUL2009FOR

Munawar, S., Yousaf, H. Q., Ahmed, M., & Rehman, S. (2023). The influence of online entrepreneurial education on entrepreneurial success: An empirical study in Pakistan. *The International Journal of Management Education*, *21*(1), 100752.

Nurvita, D., Rohima, S., Bashir, A., & Mardalena, M. (2022). The role of public spending on education, health, and economic growth toward human development index in the local economy. *Sriwijaya International Journal of Dynamic Economics and Business*, 197–210.

Pradana, I. P. Y. B., Susanto, E., & Kumorotomo, W. (2022). Analyzing the critical factors for innovation sustainability in the public sector: Evidence from Indonesia. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, *35*(7), 733–748.

Pradana, M., Elisa, H. P., & Syarifuddin, S. (2023). Discussing ChatGPT in education: A literature review and bibliometric analysis. *Cogent Education*, *10*(2), 2243134. https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2243134

Pradhan, M., Suryadarma, D., Beatty, A., Wong, M., Gaduh, A., Alisjahbana, A., & Artha, R. P. (2014). Improving educational quality through enhancing community participation: Results from a

randomized field experiment in Indonesia. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, *6*(2), 105–126.

Pratiwi, D. I., & Waluyo, B. (2023). Autonomous learning and the use of digital technologies in online English classrooms in higher education. *Contemporary Educational Technology*, *15*(2), ep423.

Prita Prabawangi, R., Megasari Noer Fatanti, & Kun Sila Ananda. (2021). After a Year of Online Learning Amid the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Survey of Indonesian Undergraduate Students' Opinions and Behaviors | Asian Journal of University Education. *Asian Journal of University Education (AJUE)*, *17*(4). https://myjms.mohe.gov.my/index.php/AJUE/article/view/16211

QS World University Rankings 2023: Top Global Universities. (n.d.). Top Universities. Retrieved 28 August 2023, from https://www.topuniversities.com/university-rankings/world-university-rankings/2023

Qureshi, N., & Kalsoom, Q. (2022). Teacher Education in Pakistan: Structure, Problems, and Opportunities. In M. S. Khine & Y. Liu (Eds.), *Handbook of Research on Teacher Education* (pp. 971–986). Springer Nature Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-9785-2_50

RAHMAN, A., NURSINI, N., & ANWAR, A. I. (2021). EDUCATION OUTCOME IN EASTERN INDONESIA THROUGH EDUCATION EXPENDITURE. *ICCD*, *3*(1), 321–331. http://iccd.asia/ojs/index.php/iccd/article/view/370

Raza, H., Ali, A., Rafiq, N., Xing, L., Asif, T., & Jing, C. (2023). Comparison of higher education in Pakistan and China: A sustainable development in student's perspective. *Sustainability*, *15*(5), 4327.

Reza, S., Mubarik, M. S., Naghavi, N., & Nawaz, R. R. (2021). Internationalisation challenges of SMEs: Role of intellectual capital. *International Journal of Learning and Intellectual Capital*, *18*(3), 252. https://doi.org/10.1504/IJLIC.2021.116468

Safdar, G., & Khan, A. W. (2020). Digital Media Use and Cultural Aspiration Among Female of Pakistan: A Study of Three Public Sector Universities. *Journal of Research & Reviews in Social Sciences Pakistan*, *3*(2), 941–956.

Saqib, Z. A., Zhang, Q., Ou, J., Saqib, K. A., Majeed, S., & Razzaq, A. (2020). Education for sustainable development in Pakistani higher education institutions: An exploratory study of students' and teachers' perceptions. *International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education*, *21*(6), 1249–1267.

Shaturaev, J. (2021). A Comparative Analysis of Public Education System of Indonesia and Uzbekistan. *Bioscience Biotechnology Research Communications*, *14*(5), 89–92. https://doi.org/10.21786/bbrc/14.5/18

Sibawaihi, S., & Fernandes, V. (2023). Globalizing higher education through internationalization and multiculturalism: The case of Indonesia. *Higher Education Quarterly*, *77*(2), 232–245.

Sudianto, L., & Simon, P. (2021). Development application of a quality assurance management information system for Paulus Indonesia Christian University. *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering*, *1088*(1), 012042. https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1757-899X/1088/1/012042/meta

Suryadarma, D. (2009). Why are Muslims Left Behind in Education? Evidence from Indonesia. *Evidence from Indonesia (July 31, 2009)*. https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1440489

Suryadarma, D., & Suryahadi, A. (2010). *Determinants of Education Attainment in Developing Countries: Can Higher Skills Compensate for Poverty? Ψ*. https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/www/external/labor/FLS/IFLS/papers/2010_suryadarma-2.pdf

Tadjudin, M. K. (2009). Quality Assurance in Indonesian Higher Education. In T. W. Bigalke & D. E. Neubauer (Eds.), *Higher Education in Asia/Pacific* (pp. 149–164). Palgrave Macmillan US. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230100466_11

Teixeira, P. N., & Shin, J. C. (Eds.). (2020). Higher Education Inequality. In *The International Encyclopedia of Higher Education Systems and Institutions* (pp. 697–697). Springer Netherlands. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-8905-9_300313

Tian, M. (2022). Development experience and enlightenment of internationalization of higher education in Indonesia. *Transactions on Comparative Education*, *4*(2), 17–23.

Wang, C. (2019). Building a Network for Preserving Intangible Cultural Heritage through Education: A Study of Indonesian Batik. *International Journal of Art & Design Education*, *38*(2), 398–415. https://doi.org/10.1111/jade.12200

Warwick, P. (2014). The international business of higher education–A managerial perspective on the internationalisation of UK universities. *The International Journal of Management Education*, *12*(2), 91–103.

Xie, D., Saeed, N., Akhter, S., & Kumar, T. (2023). A step towards a sustainable environment in top Asian countries: The role of higher education and technology innovation. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja*, *36*(3), 2152359. https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2022.2152359

Yudono, M. A. S., Faris, R. M., De Wibowo, A., Sidik, M., Sembiring, F., & Aji, S. F. (2022). Fuzzy Decision Support System for ABC University Student Admission Selection. *International Conference on Economics, Management and Accounting (ICEMAC 2021)*, 230–237. https://www.atlantis-press.com/proceedings/icemac-21/125970181

Zahid, G., & Neary, S. (2023). Faculty members' perceptions of internationalization of curriculum: Globalization and localization, a comparative study. *Asian Education and Development Studies*, *12*(2/3), 166–180.

Zakaria, M., Janjua, S. Y., & Fida, B. A. (2016). Internationalization of higher education: Trends and policies in Pakistan. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, *38*(1), 75–88.